

No.P-17024/25/2013-RC
Government of India
Ministry of Rural Development
Department of Rural Development
(Rural Connectivity Division)

Krishi Bhavan, New Delhi,
Dated 2nd September, 2013

Subject: Meeting of Pre-Empowered Committee meeting to discuss the proposals of State of Tripura under Phase-X (2013-14), Batch-II) under PMGSY – minutes thereon.

A copy of the minutes of the Pre-Empowered Committee meeting held on 30th August, 2013 at 5.30 PM under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary (RC) at Agartala, Tripura to discuss the proposals of State of Tripura under Phase-X (2013-14, Batch-II) of Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana (PMGSY) is forwarded herewith for necessary action.


(P. Manoj Kumar)
Director (RC)

Tel. No. 011-23074307

Encl : As above

Distribution:

- i. Principal Secretary, Public Works Department (PWD), Government of Tripura, Secretariat Complex, Agartala, Tripura-799006.
- ii. Chief Executive Officer, Tripura Rural Road development Agency (TRRDA), PWD, Government of Tripura, Secretariat Complex, Agartala, Tripura-799006.

Copy to:

Sr PPS to Secretary (RD)/ PPS to AS&FA/ PS to JS (RC)/ Director (RC-YSD)/ Deputy Secretary (RC-MR)/ All Directors (NRRDA)

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PRE-EMPOWERED COMMITTEE FOR
PMGSY HELD ON 30th AUGUST, 2013.**

STATE: TRIPURA

A Meeting of the Pre- Empowered Committee was held on 30th August 2013 at 5.30 pm at Agartala under the chairmanship of Joint Secretary (RC), MoRD to discuss the proposals of the State of Tripura under Phase-X (2013-14, Batch-II) of Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana (PMGSY). List of participants is given at Annexure.

2. Details of proposals discussed by the Committee for the State of Tripura are as under:

Phase --X (2013-14, Batch-II)

| Item | New Connectivity | | Up gradation | | Total |
|----------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------|--------------|---------|-----------------------------------|
| | Roads | LSBs | Roads | LSBs | |
| Value in Rs. Crores | 138.26 | 21.06 | 507.87 | 18.95 | 686.14 |
| No. of Road works | 36 | 15 | 105 | 15 | 141 roads 26 bridges |
| Length in Km | 152.30 | 426.10 m | 690.87 | 364.0 m | 843.17 km Road 790.1 m Bridges |
| Average Cost in Lakhs / Km | 90.78 | | 73.51 | | - |
| No. of Habitations | 24 of 250 + 103 of 250 less | | | | 24 of 250 + 103 of 250 less |
| Maintenance cost | 9.23 % of the construction cost | | | | |

3. The Pre-Empowered Committee reviewed the progress of the implementation of PMSGY in the State of Tripura since the previous Empowered Committee Meetings held on 28.3.2013 considered the institutional capacity of the State to efficiently execute the PMGSY works with the requisite attention to quality.

4. Habitation Details

The details of net eligibility* of unconnected habitations in respect of the State of Tripura are as follows:

| Item | 1000+ | 500+ | 250+ | Total |
|---|-------|------|------|-------|
| As on 1 st April, 2000 (as reported by the State on | 166 | 588 | 1172 | 1926 |

| | | | | |
|---|-----|-----|------|------|
| OMMAS) | | | | |
| As per NRRDA record provided by the State | 169 | 606 | 966 | 1741 |
| Additional Habitations approved as per Cabinet note of Feb 2013 | - | - | - | - |
| Unconnected Habitation after approval of Cabinet Approval | 169 | 606 | 966 | 1741 |
| Unconnected Habitation entered on OMMAS by the State | 166 | 588 | 1172 | 1926 |

* excluding habitations covered under other schemes and also habitations not feasible to be connected.

5. Physical Progress

- i. The Pre-Empowered Committee reviewed the pace of the implementation in the State. Out of 1196 works sanctioned (including Phase IX), the State has reported to have completed 885 road works, 311 works are still incomplete including 55 works, which were sanctioned prior to March 2011. The status of phase-wise/year-wise completion of road works as reported by the State is given below.

| Year of sanction | Phase | Sanctioned works | Completed works | Pending |
|------------------|-------|------------------|-----------------|------------|
| 2000-01 | I | 194 | 193 | 1 |
| 2001-02 | II | 42 | 42 | 0 |
| 2004-05 | III | 34 | 34 | 0 |
| 2005-06 | IV | 38 | 38 | 0 |
| 2006-07 | V | 227 | 215 | 12 |
| 2007-08 | VI | 323 | 298 | 25 |
| 2008-09 | VII | 65 | 48 | 17 |
| 2011-12 | VIII | 69 | 17 | 52 |
| 2013-14 | IX | 204 | - | 204 |
| Total | | 1196 | 885 | 311 |

- ii. While reviewing the progress of works in the State, the Committee reviewed the work done by the Central Agencies namely NBCC and HSCL. While observing the work of NBCC as satisfactory, the Committee expressed serious concern about the poor quality of works executed by HSCL in the State. It was decided that MoRD would issue a letter to HSCL, indicating their poor execution performance in Tripura.

6. Completion Plan

The Committee reviewed the completion plan formulated by the State and observed that the State is not adhering to the plan. During the last two quarters (January to June 2013), against the

target of 90 road works having 443.65 kms length, the State has completed 47 road works (52%) covering 193.9 kms length (44%). The Committee expressed serious concern about the non adherence to the completion plan.

7. DPR issues

Some of the observations of NRRDA based on the scrutiny of sample proposals are as under which should be rectified by the State before seeking the date for Empowered Committee:

- i. The provision of Box Culvert should be replaced by Hume pipe culvert/ slab culverts.
- ii. The provision of 100 mm WBM G-2 should be reduced to 75 mm.
- iii. The provision of overhead and contractors profit @ 15.50 % should be reduced to 12.50%.
- iv. The provision of earth work appears to be on higher side.
- v. In case of upgradation, the existing crust thickness has not been considered in the design.
- vi. The hydraulic calculation of CDs were not attached in DPR.
- vii. The provision of bridges more than 15.00 m should be separate from road proposal and entered separately on OMMAS.
- viii. The average cost / km reported is on the higher side in comparison with the proposals sanctioned in the previous phases to the State.
- ix. The foundation level has not been fixed as per scour depth calculation. This needs to be revised.
- x. The joint inspection report signed by STA and SE has not been furnished.
- xi. The photographs attached were not as per DPR Template.
- xii. The documents regarding the provision of additional land required have not been attached in DPR from land owner.

8. Quality

8.1 It was observed that the number of inspections carried out by SQMs during the last two years was adequate. Further, in case of completed works, out of 194 SQM inspections during the period April 2011 to June 2013, 24 works were graded as 'Unsatisfactory' (12%). In the case on-going works, 295 SQM inspections have been carried out during the same period, out of which 92 works were graded as 'Unsatisfactory' (31%). The NQM reports show that number of 'Unsatisfactory' works for the same period is 25% in case of completed works and 46 % in case of on-going works. The Committee expressed serious concern on the poor quality of construction of road and advised the State to address the issue and ensure that appropriate action is taken on all unsatisfactory works as per PMGSY guidelines.

8.2. As regards submission of Action Taken Reports (ATR) of NQM inspections, out of 58 ATRs required, only 13 ATRs have been uploaded. The State was advised to take immediate action to upload remaining 45 ATRs on OMMAS.

9. Maintenance

9.1. The details of maintenance funds required, released to SRRDA and utilized by them during the last three years and current year is given below.

(in crore)

| Financial Year | Maintenance Funds (as per contracts) | Actual release to SRRDA | Expenditure | % of expenditure w.r.t fund required |
|---------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|--------------|--------------------------------------|
| 2010-11 | 4.57 | 2.00 | 0.51 | 11% |
| 2011-12 | 8.29 | 14.87 | 2.80 | 34% |
| 2012-13 | 12.63 | 10.78 | 4.35 | 34% |
| 2013-14 (upto June) | 15.72 | 18.53 | 3.44 | 22% |
| Total | 41.21 | 46.18 | 11.10 | |

9.2. It was observed that the State did not spend as per the requirement on maintenance of roads constructed under PMGSY. The State was advised to prepare a comprehensive maintenance plan for maintaining the assets created under PMGSY. The Committee desired that the State Government's attention be drawn to the provision of para 17.1 of PMGSY Guidelines regarding maintenance which states that "the putting in place of institutional measures to ensure systematic maintenance and providing adequate funding for maintenance of the rural Core Network, particularly the Through Routes, will be the key to the continuance of the PMGSY programme in the State".

10. Road Condition Survey

As per OMMAS, against the total road length of 8681 kms, the State has entered PCI value for 190 kms length during the year 2012-13 and 420 kms length during the year 2013-14, which is just 7%.

11. Absorption Capacity

As per the capacity assessment study (based on ongoing works excluding works proposed to be dropped, number of SQMs, average expenditure and no. of PIUs) the State does not have the capacity to take up any additional works during the financial year 2013-14. The execution capacity of the State based on the index on expenditure, maintenance and quality inspections is given below:

Execution Capacity of the State

| # | Basis | No. of PIU | Work Load per PIU (Rs. in Crore) | Total (Rs. in Crores) |
|---|-------|---|---|-----------------------------|
| 1 | PIU | PWD (11) NBCC (3) HSCL (2) Total: (16) | 75 75 75 | 1200 |
| # | Basis | No. of SQM | Capacity of a SQM to inspect work worth | Cost of Work (Rs. in crore) |

| | | (Rs. in Crore) | | | |
|--|---------------------------|----------------|---------|---------|---|
| 2 | SQM | 32 | 207 | | 6,624 |
| Average construction cost per km Rs.0.42 Crore | | | | | |
| # | Basis | Year(s) | | | Maximum Expenditure+10% per year (Rs. in Crore) |
| | | 2010-11 | 2011-12 | 2012-13 | |
| 3 | Expenditure(Rs. in Crore) | 238 | 230 | 202 | 317 |

Work load required according to expenditure of Rs.317 Core is = Rs.317*3-Rs.951 Crore

Lowest of the above three parameters = Rs. 95 Crore

1. According to expenditure – Rs.317 Crore – Rs. 317 Cr. *1= Rs.317 Crore
2. According to Maintenance – Rs.317 Crore – Rs.317 Cr. *0.29 = Rs.92 Crore
3. According to Quality - Rs.317 Crore – Rs. 317 Cr. * 0.24 = Rs.76 Cr. Capacity according to index is sum of these three = Rs 485 Cr.

Balance works in Hand (31.07.2013) = Rs. 840 Cr.

Net Capacity = Rs. 485 Cr – 840 Cr = - Rs. 355 crore.

12. Annual Allocation of the State for the year 2013-14

The annual allocation of the State for the year is Rs. 311 crore. The State has informed that an anticipated expenditure of Rs. 325 crore will be made during 2013-14. The State has OB (as on 1.4.2013) to the tune of Rs. 136 Cr (including interest). The State therefore may actually require an amount of Rs. 189 Cr. to complete the on-going works during the current financial year. Further, the State has been sanctioned 204 works covering 579.27 kms length amounting to Rs. 462.41 crore under Phase IX during the current financial year. Since the State is eligible to receive only Rs. 311 crore during the current financial year as per annual allocation, the current proposal amounting to Rs.686.14 crore may not be accommodated during the current financial year.

13. Status of works cleared under Phase IX

This Ministry cleared a proposal under Phase IX on 29th April 2013 for 204 works (197 roads and 7 LSBs) works covering 579.27 kms length amounting to Rs. 462.41 crore. The State informed that all works were tendered and will be awarded shortly. The Committee advised the State to complete the process quickly and atleast 70% of the works should be awarded before seeking date for EC meeting and 90% of the works before issuing formal clearance of the current proposal.

14. Financial Management/Accounting

The following discrepancies have been observed while examining the accounts for 2011-12:

- i. Interest amount of Rs.7,41,52, 037 earned by PSUs has not been adjusted while releasing the funds by TRRDA to the PSUs.

- ii. A difference amount of Rs.1.16 crores has been observed in the amount of FD shown in banker certificate and the balance sheet.
- iii. An unpaid bill of Rs.26.41 Crore has been observed.
- iv. A difference amount of Rs. 105.73 Crore has been observed in the balance sheet and UC for the year 2011-12.
- v. Out of 882 completed works, only 403 works have been financially closed, which is just 46%.
- vi. The State informed that the OMMAS generated balance sheet for the year 2011-12 has been reconciled. NRRDA is required to examine and to ensure the same.

The State should take immediate action to rectify all issues referred at Para 14 above:

15. The State will complete following activities to fix up an early date for Empowered Committee Meeting.

- i. The issues brought out by NRRDA in respect of the DPRs as listed at para 7 above should be rectified.
- ii. At least 15% of the length of the road in the current batch should be proposed under R&D Technology in consultation with STAs.
- iii. All DPRs should be entered on OMMAS after duly vetted by STAs and due corrections as suggested by NRRDA.
- iv. Action should be taken to send ATRs on 45 NQM reports and upload on OMMAS. An action plan for furnishing all pending ATRs should be furnished.
- v. Habitation data entry on OMMAS should be completed.
- vi. Financial closure should be made for at least 80% of the completed works.
- vii. The average construction cost appears to be on higher side. The construction cost should be appropriately reduced.
- viii. The State informed that all works sanctioned on 29th April 2013 were tendered and will be awarded shortly. The Committee advised the State to complete the process quickly and at least 70% of the works should be awarded before seeking date for EC meeting and 90% of the works before issuing formal clearance of the current furnished.
- ix. The status of progress of works completed during the last two quarter and the current quarter vis-à-vis the completion plan should be reported.
- x. The State should prepare an action plan to address the issues of quality of construction of roads.
- xi. Action should be initiated to complete PCI survey for 50% of the rural roads during the current year.

The State should send a compliance report to the Ministry/ NRRDA on all issues as indicated at para 15 above before seeking date for EC meeting.

16. The meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

Annexure

List of participants in the meeting of the Pre- Empowered Committee held on 30th August
2013 at Agartala

| | |
|---|--|
| Shri Rajesh Bhushan | Joint Secretary (RC), MoRD--- in the Chair |
| Shri P.Manoj Kumar | Director(RC) , MoRD |
| Shri Y.S.Dwivedi | Director(RC) , MoRD |
| Shri Prabha Kant Katare | Director (P-III & CQC), NRRDA |
| Dr. I.K.Pateriya | Director (Tech), NRRDA |
| Shri N.C.Solanki | Director (P-I), NRRDA |
| State Govt. Representatives | |
| Shri S.R.Kumar | Secretary, PWD, Tripura |
| Shri R.K.Majumder | Chief Executive Officer, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Sukamal Bhattacharya | CE, EO & SQC, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Kamal Sarkar | Superintending Engineer, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Sankar Saha | Executive Engineer, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Pradip Bhattacharya | ITNO, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Mrinal Choudhury | FC, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Biswajit Majumdar | Assistant Engineer, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Subrata Ray | Assistant Engineer, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Swadesh Ghosh | Assistant Engineer, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Sudip Chakraborty | JE, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Kaushik Bhowmik | JE, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Raju Chowdhury | Shri JE, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Shri Sujit Debnath | JE, PMGSY, Tripura |
| Representatives from HSCL and NBCC | |
| Shri B.K.Sarkar | Head(Project), HSCL |
| Shri Dipen Mukharjee | Dy. Head(Project), HSCL |
| Shri Alok Ranjan | General Manager, NBCC |
| Shri A.K.Sarkar | Dy. General Manager,NBCC |